



# Maria Baghramian

Nationality: Irish     Email address: [maria.baghramian@ucd.ie](mailto:maria.baghramian@ucd.ie)     Website: <https://mariabaghramian.com>

 Work: School of Philosophy University College Dublin, D4 Dublin (Ireland)

## WORK EXPERIENCE

---

### Full Professor of Philosophy

*University College Dublin* [ 01/07/2014 – Current ]

City: Dublin

Country: Ireland

### Professor II, Department of Philosophy University of Oslo

*University of Oslo* [ 01/01/2022 – 01/01/2025 ]

City: Oslo

Country: Norway

### Co-Director, Cognitive Science Graduate Programme

*University College Dublin* [ 01/09/2000 – Current ]

City: Dublin

Country: Ireland

### Professor of American Philosophy

*University College Dublin* [ 01/09/2007 – 01/07/2014 ]

City: Dublin

Country: Ireland

### Lecturer/Senior Lecturer

*Department of Philosophy, UCD* [ 01/10/1990 – 01/09/2007 ]

City: Dublin

Country: Ireland

### Part-Time Lecturer

*Trinity College Dublin* [ 01/10/1985 – 01/10/1990 ]

City: Dublin

Country: Ireland

## EDUCATION AND TRAINING

---

### PhD in Philosophy

*Trinity College Dublin* [ 01/10/1983 – 01/09/1990 ]

City: Dublin

Country: Ireland

Field(s) of study: Philosophy of Logic, Supervisor: Timothy Williamson

### BA, Honours, Philosophy and Social Anthropology (Double First and First Place in both subjects)

*Queen's University Belfast* [ 01/10/1979 – 07/07/1983 ]

City: Belfast

Country: United Kingdom

## **PROJECTS**

---

### **Science and Democracy, University of Oslo Research Project**

[ 05/02/2022 – Current ]

Link: <https://www.uio.no/english/research/strategic-research-areas/democracy/research/groups/science-and-democracy/>

### **PERITIA-Policy, Expertise and Trust in Action, European Commission, Horizon 2020**

[ 01/02/2020 – 30/05/2023 ]

Link: <https://peritia-trust.eu>

### **Irish Research Council New Horizons Project: When Experts Disagree**

[ 06/01/2015 – 15/12/2019 ]

### **The American Voice in Philosophy: IRCHSS New Ideas Award**

[ 01/08/2011 – 01/08/2015 ]

Link: [https://www.american-voice.org/#:~:text=With four project members based,dimensions of philosophy in America](https://www.american-voice.org/#:~:text=With%20four%20project%20members%20based,dimensions%20of%20philosophy%20in%20America)

### **Aporo: Irish Network of Excellence in Philosophy of Language**

[ 01/10/2003 – 01/10/2008 ]

.

## **HONOURS AND AWARDS**

---

### **Research Impact Award**

University College Dublin [ 24/01/2024 ]

Link: <https://www.ucd.ie/research/impact/casestudies/peritiaunderstandingandfosteringtrustinexpertsandexpertise/>

### **Researcher of the Year: Highly Commended**

Irish Research Council [ 08/12/2022 ]

Link: <https://research.ie/what-we-do/loveirishresearch/blog/irish-research-council-2022-researcher-of-the-year-winners/>

### **Elected Member: Academia Europaea**

Academia Europaea [ 08/08/2022 ]

Link: [https://www.ae-info.org/ae/Member/Baghramian\\_Maria](https://www.ae-info.org/ae/Member/Baghramian_Maria)

### **Elected Member: International Institute of Philosophy**

IIP [ 20/01/2021 ]

Member of Selection Committee, Elected 2023

Member of Programme Committee, Appointed 2024

## **Fulbright Fellowship**

The Fulbright Commission [ 06/06/2013 ]

## **Elected Member: The Royal Irish Academy**

The Royal Irish Academy [ 30/05/2010 ]

## **President's Research Fellowship**

University College Dublin [ 10/04/2009 ]

## **President's Research Award**

UCD [ 01/10/1987 ]

## **President's Research Fellowship**

University College Dublin [ 01/09/1999 ]

## **MANAGEMENT AND LEADERSHIP SKILLS**

---

**Head, UCD School of Philosophy, 2011-2013 and 2017-2019**

**Founder, UCD Centre for Ethics in Public Life, 2017**

**Co-Founder, UCD Newman Centre for the Study of Religions, 2013**

**Founder and two-time President, Society for Women in Philosophy-Ireland, 2010**

Link: <https://www.swip-ireland.com>

**Co-Founder: UCD Graduate Programme in Cognitive Science**

## **Mentor: Funded Postdoctoral Fellowships**

Matthew Shields, PERITIA, 2021

Melanie Altanian, IRC, The Testimonial Injustice of Genocide Denial, 2020

Michel Croce, PERITIA, 2019

Patrizia Setola, IRC, The Value of Sentient Beings, 2019

Mark Bowker, IRC, Meaning and Meaninglessness, 2018-20

Elmar Unnsteinnson, How we Understand Absurdity, 2016-18

Thomas Hodgson, IRC, Language and the world, 2016-18

Finnur Dellsen, When Experts Disagree, 2016-18

Nick Hughes, IRC, Epistemic Dilemmas, 2015-17

Kevin Lynch, IRC, Intentional Action in Self-Deception, 2013

Sarin Marchetti, IRC, The Quiet Revolution, 2014-16

Douglas Edwards, IRC, Philosophical Minimalism, 2009-2011

Jack Ritchie, IRC, Science at the Boundaries, 2006-2008

## **Postdoctoral Placement Record**

Tenured or long term academic posts in the USA, Ireland, Italy, Iceland, South Africa, China, Korea, Germany

Further Research Fellowship, Oxford

Awards for research in the period of fellowship

Dr Finnur Dellsen, WEXD Postdoctoral Fellow received

Lauener Prize for Up-and-Coming Philosophers, 2019

Nils Klim Prize for young Nordic scholars in the humanities, social science, law, and theology, 2019

Motivation Award for Young Researchers from the Icelandic Research Fund, 2019

Dr Douglas Edwards was awarded the American Philosophical Association's Sanders Book Prize for his book *The Metaphysics of Truth*, 2019.

### **Postgraduate Supervision**

10 PhDs and 6 MLitts by Research supervised to completion

2 PhDs ongoing

8 Irish Research Council Graduate Fellowship Awards

### **Teaching**

BA Programme: Module Design and Coordination of 15 new undergraduate modules

MA Programme Design and Coordination: Consciousness and Embodiment

MSc Programme: Cognitive Science Co-Design & Coordination

Guest Lecturer: Trinity College Dublin, Oxford University Weekend School, NEH Summer School, Summer Schools in Philosophy of Language in China, Yerevan Academy of Linguistics and Philosophy

## **INTERNATIONAL ACADEMIC APPOINTMENTS**

---

### **Swedish Collegium for Advanced Study**

[ 01/01/2024 – Current ]

Link: [http://www.swedishcollegium.se/subfolders/Fellows/Invited\\_Fellows/2023-24/baghramian.html](http://www.swedishcollegium.se/subfolders/Fellows/Invited_Fellows/2023-24/baghramian.html)

### **British Academy: "Trust, Expertise & Policymaking: Response to Covid 19" Working Group**

[ 17/05/2020 – 18/05/2020 ]

### **All European Academies Working Group: Fake or Fact**

[ 01/06/2020 – 01/05/2021 ]

Link: <https://allea.org/portfolio-item/fact-or-fake/>

### **SAPEA: Science Policy Advice in a Time of Uncertainty**

[ 15/11/2017 – 09/07/2019 ]

Link: <https://www.ria.ie/news/policy-and-international-relations-international-activities/making-sense-science-policy-under>

### **British Academy & All European Academies (ALLEA): Truth, Trust, and Expertise Working Group**

[ 05/09/2018 – 01/11/2019 ]

Link: <https://allea.org/truth-trust-and-expertise/>

### **Visiting Lecturer University of Oxford: Weekend School on Truth and Relativism with Prof.**

**Timothy Williamson**

[ 26/11/2016 – 27/11/2016 ]

### **Philosophy Fellow, Department of Philosophy, Harvard University**

[ 02/02/2014 – 02/05/2014 ]

### **Visiting Expert, National Endowment for the Humanities: University of New Mexico**

[ 15/06/2027 – 30/06/2027 ]

### **Lecturer at Summer Schools & Research Advisor: China National Research Centre for Linguistics and Applied Linguistics**

[ 01/07/2007 – 30/06/2010 ]

### **Subject Specialist, UK Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education**

[ 01/01/2001 – 01/04/2002 ]

## Visiting Fellow, Department of Philosophy, Harvard University

[ 01/02/1997 – 01/06/1998 ]

## Visiting Overseas Scholar, Department of Linguistics, M.I.T.

[ 05/01/1997 – 30/05/1997 ]

### **PUBLICATIONS**

---

#### **Books (2014-2024)**

Baghramian M, Carter, A & Cosker-Rowland, R (2024 forthcoming), *The Routledge Handbook of Philosophy of Disagreement*, London/New York: Routledge.

Altanian, M & Baghramian, M (eds.) (2023), *Testimonial Injustice and Trust*. London: Routledge.

Baghramian, M & Martini, C (2022), *Questioning Experts and Expertise*. London, London: Routledge.

Baghramian, M, Stout, R, & Papazian, M (2020), *The Value of Empathy*, London: Taylor and Francis.

Baghramian, M & Coliva, A. (2019), *Relativism: New Problems of Philosophy*, London/New York: Routledge.

Baghramian, M (ed.) (2019), *From Trust to Trustworthiness*, London: Taylor And Francis.

Baghramian, M & Marchetti, S. (eds.), *Pragmatism and the European Traditions: Encounters with Analytic Philosophy and Phenomenology Before the Great Divide*. London and New York: Routledge.

Baghramian, M (Ed.) (2014), *The Many Faces of Relativism*. London: Routledge.

#### **Articles and Book Chapters (2014-2024)**

Croce, M & Baghramian, M (forthcoming). Experts and Expertise Part I & Part II, *Philosophy Compass*.

Baghramian, M, (2024, forthcoming) "Overcoming the Big Divide?", *International Journal of Philosophical Studies*, vol 31.

Baghramian, M & Shields, M (2023). Hilary Putnam. In Scott Aikin & Robert B. Talisse (eds.), *The Routledge Companion to Pragmatism*. New York: Routledge. 75-80.

Baghramian, M & Panizza, S (2022 online). Skepticism and the Value of Distrust. *Inquiry: An Interdisciplinary Journal of Philosophy*.

Baghramian, M & Coliva, A (2022). Précis. *Analysis* 82 (3):477-479.

Baghramian, Maria & Coliva, Annalisa (2022). Replies to Commentators. *Analysis* 82 (3):514-525.

Gundersen, T, Alinejad, D, Branch, TY, Duffy, B, Hewlett, K, Holst, C, Owens, S, Panizza, F, Tellmann, SM, van Dijck, J, Baghramian, M (2022), A New Dark Age? Truth, Trust, and Environmental Science, *Annual Review of Environment and Resources* 2022 47 (1) 5-29

Baghramian, M., & Croce, M. (2021). Experts, Public Policy, and the Question of Trust. In M. Hannon, & J. de Ridder (Eds.), *The Routledge Handbook of Political Epistemology*. London and New York: Routledge.

Baghramian, M. (2020). The Politics of Relativism. *The Philosopher*, 108(3), 51–58.

Baghramian, M. (2020). Foreword. In J. Simon (Ed.), *The Routledge Handbook of Trust and Philosophy*. London and New York: Routledge. xvii-xix.

Baghramian, M. (2020). Experts, Disagreement, and Trust. In B. Mooney (Ed.), *Ireland's Yearbook of Education*. Dublin, Ireland: Education Matters: 354–358.

Baghramian, M. (2019). I—The Virtues of Relativism. *Aristotelian Society, Supplementary Volume* 93(1), 247–269.

Beebe, J. R., Baghramian, M., Drury, L., & Dellsén, F. (2019). Divergent Perspectives on Expert Disagreement: Preliminary Evidence from Climate Science, Climate Policy, Astrophysics, and Public Opinion. *Environmental Communication*, 13(1), 35–50.

Baghramian, M. (2017). Comments on Annalisa Coliva, Extended Rationality: A Hinge Epistemology. *International Journal for the Study of Skepticism*, 7(4):272–280.

Baghramian, M., & Jorgensen, A. (2015). Quine, Kripke, Putnam: Meaning, Necessity and Intuitions. In Beaney, M (Ed.) *The Oxford Handbook of the History of Analytic Philosophy*. Oxford: Oxford University Press: 594-620.

Baghramian, M. (2014). Relativism about Science. In Psillos, S & Curd, M (eds.), *The Routledge Companion to Philosophy of Science*, 2nd ed, London, New York: Routledge: 268–279.

Baghramian, M (2014). The Depths and Shallows of Philosophical Style. *Journal of Philosophical Research* 39: 311-323.

## Encyclopaedia Entries

Baghramian, M. and J. Adam Carter, "Relativism", *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Spring 2022 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.), URL = <<https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/spr2022/entries/relativism/>>.

Baghramian, M. (2015). Putnam, Hilary (1926-). *International Encyclopedia of the Social & Behavioral Sciences*, 2nd ed. (pp. 662-667). doi:10.1016/B978-0-08-097086-8.61263-1

Baghramian, M., & McHugh, F. (2015). Rorty, Richard (1931-2007). *International Encyclopedia of the Social & Behavioral Sciences*, 2nd ed. (pp. 761-766). doi:10.1016/B978-0-08-097086-8.61270-9

Baghramian, M. (2015). Relativism: Philosophical Aspects. In *International Encyclopedia of the Social & Behavioral Sciences*, 2nd ed. (pp. 233-238). doi:10.1016/B978-0-08-097086-8.63075-1

## Policy Reports and Working Papers

Fact or Fake? Tackling Science Disinformation, ALLEA Discussion Paper No. 5, 2021.

Making Sense of Science for Policy Under Conditions of Complexity and Uncertainty. SAPEA Working Group Evidence Review Report, 2019.

ALLEA Working Papers on Truth Trust, Expertise: Onora O'Neill and Ed Noort (Co-Chairs), Maria Baghramian, José van Dijck, Luke Drury, Gloria Origgi, Christiane Woopen, 1. Loss of Trust? Loss of Trustworthiness? Truth and Expertise Today (2018), 2. Trust Within : Dynamics and Norms of Knowledge Production (2019) 3. Trust in Science and Changing Landscapes of Communication (2019). Berlin: All European Academies.

Subject-specialist reports on the provisions for teaching philosophy at University of East Anglia (2002).

University of Cambridge (2002), Open University, UK (2002), Anglia Polytechnic University (2002), Southgate House, London: Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education.

## Interviews and Media

"Public Trust in Experts Put to Test", [Cordis Report](#), 2024

Baghramian, M. Institute of Art and Ideas. Philosophy for our Time. Trust in a Relative World. An interview with Maria Baghramian. February 2, 2021

Baghramian, M & Bergin, S, Recreating climate of trust in experts essential for beating Covid-19. Irish Times. Opinion, November, 4, 2020

Baghramian, M., Van Dijck, J., Duffy, B., & Garcia-Verdugo, R. (2020). What drives public trust in science-based policies? Asks PERITIA. In European Science-Media Hub. European Parliamentary Research Service.

Baghramian, M., & Dellsen, F. (2019). The formation of a philosopher: An Interview by Finnur Dellsen. In Hugur, Icelandic Journal of Philosophy, 29, 7-14.

From doubting the truth to putting truth into question: Post-truth and the loss of faith in experts. Interview with Maria Baghramian by Dr Fabio Gironi, Institute of Philosophy, University of Potsdam, il Tascabile, 6.12.2017

Baghramian, M. Wittgenstein in Wicklow (video).

Baghramian, M. and Drury, L.( 2019). Trust must be earned, it cannot be demanded – even by scientists. Sunday Business Post. 13 October.

Baghramian, M. "Hilary Putnam: An Obituary". Irish Times, Saturday 9 April 2016.

Baghramian, M. (2015) Dealing with disagreement. BBC World Service.

How to Deal with Disagreement (2015). Dublin: The Irish Times.

## EDITED JOURNALS

---

### Journals and Special Issues

Baghramian, M. (2023). The Ethics and Politics of Disagreement. *International Journal of Philosophical Studies*, 31(3).

Shaw, A., & Baghramian, M. (2022). Ethics and the Emotions: *International Journal of Philosophical Studies*, 30(3).

Bowker, M. & Baghramian, M. (In preparation). Indeterminacy and Underdetermination Across Disciplines, Topical Issue, *Synthese*.

Baghramian, M., Stout, R., & Petherbridge, D. (2020) Special Issue On Vulnerability. *International Journal of Philosophical Studies*, 28(5).

Dellsen, F. & Baghramian, M. (2020). Special Issue, Disagreement in Science, *Synthese*.

Baghramian, M., & Martini, C. (2018 and 2019). Special Issue, Expertise and Expert Knowledge, (Volumes 1 and 2). *Social Epistemology*. 32.6 & 33.3

Shook, J., & Baghramian, M. (2014–2023). Contemporary Pragmatism, Volumes 12 (2014–2023).

Baghramian, M. (2019) Special Issue, On Empathy. *International Journal of Philosophical Studies*, 27.

Baghramian, M. (2018). Special Issue, Trust. *International Journal of Philosophical Studies*, 26(2).

Baghramian, M. Chief Editor, *International Journal of Philosophical Studies*, 2004–2014.

### CONFERENCES AND SEMINARS

---

#### A Selection of Conference and Panel Addresses (2017-24)

Baghramian, M. (2024, February) What Is Good Science? [Discussion panel]. Royal Irish Academy, Dublin, Ireand.

Baghramian, M. (August 2023). Trust in a time of crisis [Keynote address]. Congress of European Society for Analytic Philosophy, University of Vienna, Vienna, Austria.

Baghramian, M. (September 2023). PERITIA in perspective [Closing colloquium]. Trust and Distrust in Governance, Entrust II Conference, University of Siena, Siena, Italy.

Baghramian, M. (May 2023). Trust in a Time of Crisis. University of Tokyo, World Philosophy and World Crises Conference. Tokyo, Japan

Baghramian, M. (March 2023). Perspectives on trust from three Horizon 2020 projects, PERITIA Final Conference, Dublin, Ireland.

Baghramian, M. (June 2022). Trust, science and the question of objectivity, the ethics of trust and expertise [Paper presentation]. PERITIA International Conference, AUA, Yerevan, Armenia.

Baghramian, M. (June 24–25, 2021). Trust in science: nurtured, built or earned? [Panel]. SciComm Conference, Berlin, Germany.

Baghramian, M. (April 2021). Trust as norm of science (Opening keynote address). Conference on Knowledge, Citizenship, Democracy, University of Groningen, Groningen, Netherlands

Baghramian, M., Browne, T., van Dijck, J., Duffy, B., & Martini, C. (Berlin, 2020). Who to Trust on COVID-19. In Falling Walls & Berlin Science Week Panel Presentation.

Baghramian, M. (September 2020). Meta philosophy and ethics, How the Light Gets In Debate Panels. Festival of Ideas, Hay-on-Wye, Wales.

Baghramian, M. (August 30, 2019). The value of relativism. Summer School on Relativism and Rationality, Iranian Institute of Philosophy, Tehran, Iran.

Baghramian, M. (August 2019). The question of value in science. Plenary Speaker. International Wittgenstein Symposium, Kirchberg, Austria.

Baghramian, M. (July 2019). Symposium on relativism. Joint Session of the Aristotelian Society and Mind Association.

Baghramian, M. (May 24–27, 2019). How The Light Gets In Reality illusion panel. Festival of Ideas, Hay-on-Wye, Wales.

Baghramian, M. (March 2019). The value of relativism. Middle East Society for Analytic Philosophy, Cairo, Egypt.

Baghramian, M. (April 2018). Trust in science. The Science Studies Colloquium Series, University of Oslo, Oslo, Norway.

Baghramian, M. (October 2017). Conditions of trustworthiness, the case of science, British Academy, London.

Baghramian, M., & Coliva, A. (2017). Relativism and Disagreement. In *Disagreement in Science and Beyond*, UCD, Dublin,

Baghramian, M. (September 2017). The politics of relativism, relativism re-evaluated. ERC Conference, Vienna, Austria.

Baghramian, M., & Drury, L. (March 2017). In science we trust?. FISP Conference, Buenos Aires, Argentina.

Baghramian, M., & Drury, L. (April 8–30, 2017). Risky science and trust. Workshop on Risk & The Culture of Science, Trinity College, Cambridge, United Kingdom.

## **ORGANISATIONAL SKILLS**

---

### **International conferences organised in Dublin**

Annual Conference of International Institute of Philosophy, 18-20.09.2023

PERITIA Final Conference: Rethinking Trust and Expertise, 23-25, 03, 2023

Trust in a Changing World, Inaugural Symposium, PERITIA, 2-3, 03, 2020

Irish Philosophical Society Annual Conference. UCD, 9-10, 11, 2018

Methods under Microscope WEXD and DIAS, UCD, 2, 10, 2018

Trust and Expert Opinion. Closing Conference of WEXD, UCD, 28- 30,09,2018

Expertise and Expert Knowledge. WEXD & [TPM](#), 29-30, 05,2017

Society for Women in Philosophy Ireland, Annual Conference, May, 2017

Disagreement in Science. WEXD & [CSER](#), 3- 4, 07, 2017

Climate Science, Disagreement, and Policy, DIAS& UCD, 10-12, 11, 2016

The Reaches of Pragmatism: Summer Institute, UCD, 8-13, 11, 2015

Society for Women in Philosophy Ireland, Annual Conference, November 2013

Philosophies of Philosophy, Newman House, 17-19,05, 2013

Rethinking Wittgenstein, Royal Irish Academy, 26. 05, 2013

Society for Women in Philosophy Ireland, Annual Conference, October 2012

Law, State and Religion (with Amnesty International), 16-17,10, 2011

The Joint Session of the Aristotelian Society and Mind Association, 9-11,07,2010

British Society for Philosophy of Science annual conference, 7-9, 07, 2010

Putnam@80: Language, Mind and Science, UCD, 11-13,03, 2007

Relativism, Royal Irish Academy, Dublin, 25-26,05, 2003

Wittgenstein in Ireland, Royal Irish Academy, Dublin, 25,11,1999

Pluralism and Liberalism, UCD Pluralism Project Royal Irish Academy, 15–16,05,1997

Lukasiewicz in Dublin (1946-1956), 7-8, 07,1996

The Joint Session of the Aristotelian Society and Mind Association, UCD, 5-6, 07,1996

## Selected Public Lectures Convened

Martha Nussbaum (University of Chicago), "Accountability in an Era of Celebrity", Frontline Defenders of Human Rights, June 2018

Noam Chomsky (MIT), "Solidarity and the Responsibility to Respect", April 2013

John McDowell (University of Pittsburgh), "Can cognitive science determine epistemology?" 2013

Shirin Ebadi (Nobel Peace Laureate), In association with the Amnesty International , Sept 2011

Hilary Putnam (Harvard), "The Fact Value Distinction", Agnes Cuming Lectures , March 2008

## International Conferences Co-organised

Co-organiser: PERITIA conference, The Ethics of Trust and Expertise, American University of Armenia, May31-June 2 2022

Programme Committee: World Congress of Philosophy, Rome, August 1-8 2024

## Review Boards and External Examination

Research Project and Promotion Portfolio Reviewer: United States, UK, Austria, Estonia, Italy, Poland, Sweden.

External Examiner:Trinity College Dublin ( 2020-2023), University of Kent (2012-2015), University of Aberdeen, (2007-2009)

External Examiner, PhD: Trinity College Dublin, 2008; Cardiff University, 2005

## NETWORKS AND MEMBERSHIPS

### International Federation of Philosophical Societies

[ International, Current ]

Member of Steering Committee, Programme Committee, Gender Committee

### American Philosophical Association

[ USA, Current ]

Member of Internationalisation Committee

### Member of the Aristotelian Society

[ UK, 1992 ]

Local organiser of the Joint Session of the Aristotelian Society and Mind Association, 1996 and 2010

Symposiast 2019

### Member of Committee, Scholars at Risk, Ireland

[ 01/02/2008 – 01/03/2024 ]

### Board Member, Scholars at Risk, Europe

[ 30/07/2022 – Current ]

## LANGUAGE SKILLS

Mother tongue(s): **Armenian** | **Persian**

Other language(s):

**English**

**LISTENING C2 READING C2 WRITING C2**

**SPOKEN PRODUCTION C2 SPOKEN INTERACTION C2 SPOKEN INTERACTION A2**

**French**

**LISTENING B1 READING B1 WRITING A1**

*Levels: A1 and A2: Basic user; B1 and B2: Independent user; C1 and C2: Proficient user*

